

ITEM C.203
FOR INFORMATION

COMMITTEE ON THEOLOGICAL EDUCATION (COTE)
Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)
Minutes
Princeton, New Jersey
February 24-26, 2015

1. The meeting of the Committee on Theological Education (COTE) was held February 24-26, 2015, in Princeton, New Jersey, and hosted by Princeton Theological Seminary.
2. **The following persons attended, constituting a quorum:**

Members: Craig Barnes (Princeton Theological Seminary), Brian Blount (Union Presbyterian Seminary), Jeffrey Bullock (University of Dubuque Theological Seminary), William Carl (Pittsburgh Theological Seminary), Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, Mindy Douglas, Garnett Foster, José Irizarry, Michael Jinkins (Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary), James McDonald (San Francisco Theological Seminary), Matthew Miles, Kathy Wolf Reed, Marianne Rhebergen (Presbyterian Mission Agency Board liaison), Paul Roberts (Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary), William Scheu (Columbia Theological Seminary), Mary Elva Smith, Sandra Tracy, Tom Trinidad, Theodore Wardlaw (Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary), Frank Yamada (McCormick Theological Seminary).

Covenant Members: Gary Eller (Omaha Presbyterian Seminary Foundation), Doris J. Garcia-Rivera (Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico), Chris Murphy (Fuller Theological Seminary)

Staff from the Presbyterian Foundation: Lee Hinson-Hasty (Senior Director of Theological Education Funds Development) and Nancy Benson-Nicol (Associate Director for Theological Education Funds Development).

Adjunct Staff: Michelle Bartel (Presbyterian Mission Agency, Coordinator for Theological Education), Timothy Cargal (Office of the General Assembly, Associate for Preparation for Ministry/Exams), Barry Ensign-George (Presbyterian Mission Agency, Associate for Theology), Charles B. Hardwick (Presbyterian Mission Agency, Director of Theology, Worship, and Education), and Catherine Reuning (Presbyterian Mission Agency, Meeting Planning Specialist).

Guests: Barbara Wheeler and Tony Ruger (via conference call, Tuesday, February 25, 9:30-10:45 a.m.).

3. **Excused Absences:** Katherine Henderson (Auburn Theological Seminary), and Alvin Padilla (Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary).

4. Chair **Jeffrey Bullock** welcomed the committee in the Cooper Room of the Erdman Center at Princeton Theological Seminary at 5:00 P.M. on Tuesday, February 24, 2015, called the meeting to order, and

Opening Plenary:
Schedule Approved

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
September 23-25, 2015
Theology, Formation and Evangelism Ministry Area

invited **Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri** to open with prayer. **Craig Barnes** offered a welcome and words of orientation to the campus. Chair **Jeffrey Bullock** welcomed committee members and others who had gathered, noting that the start of the meeting had been delayed due to travel difficulties caused by weather. Bullock invited those gathered to introduce themselves and their place of ministry, particularly noting those for whom this was their first meeting. On behalf of the Executive Committee, Bullock asked for approval of the schedule and agenda for this meeting as approved and recommended by the Executive Committee. The **proposed schedule** was approved as distributed.

5. Chair Bullock then opened the evening's reflection on the committee's new relationship with the Presbyterian Foundation. Bullock gave background information on the new relationship, providing some history on the steps by which this new relationship was brought into being, and some information on the current shape of the relationship, including particularly the new staff positions created at the Presbyterian Foundation for strengthening the Theological Education Fund (TEF) and for strengthening COTE's fundraising efforts for theological education across the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.). Bullock invited **Lee Hinson-Hasty**, former Coordinator for Theological Education and Seminary Relations, to deliver a report and reflections on the completion of his work in that capacity and on his new position as Senior Director of Theological Education Funds Development at the Presbyterian Foundation. Hinson-Hasty offered reflections on what has been accomplished and what he anticipates accomplishing in collaboration with the committee, with Nancy Benson-Nicol, and with colleagues at the Presbyterian Foundation. Bullock next invited **Nancy Benson-Nicol**, former Associate for Theological Education Funds Development in the Presbyterian Mission Agency, to deliver a report and reflections on the transfer of her position to the Presbyterian Foundation (Associate Director for Theological Education Funds Development), and on the new shape of her position now that it is part of the Presbyterian Foundation. Benson-Nicol reflected on the relationships and responsibilities of her new position and on the possibilities and opportunities that open up through her new location. Bullock and the committee members expressed appreciation for Hinson-Hasty's and Benson-Nicol's work and hope for work to come. Bullock invited comments from the committee in response to the presentations. Discussion followed. Bullock adjourned the meeting at 5:50 P.M.

**Former
Coordinator and
Associate Reports
Received**

6. Committee members enjoyed dinner on campus in the Main Lounge at the Mackay Center, followed by a dessert reception hosted by Craig Barnes at Springdale, the seminary president's residence.

Dinner

Wednesday, February 25

7. Chair **Jeffrey Bullock** called to order the Executive Committee at 7:50 A.M. on Wednesday, February 25, 2015 in the balcony meeting space at the McKay Center cafeteria. Bullock opened the meeting with prayer. Bullock then gave an explanation of the new relationship between the

**Executive
Committee
Meeting**

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
September 23-25, 2015
Theology, Formation and Evangelism Ministry Area

committee and the Presbyterian Foundation. Bullock opened the floor for discussion, which focused particularly on the working relationship with the new Director and Associate Director. Discussion focused on a) the need for an analysis of feasibility, b) the importance of establishing protocols, c) the need to develop collaborative projects, d) the importance of developing next steps for the Director and Associate Director that will be clear and readily communicable, e) the need to develop a clear plan for what will happen over the next months, through the first year of work in this new structure. It was proposed to **establish a working group** consisting of Frank Yamada, Mindy Douglas, Rob Bullock (of the Presbyterian Foundation), and another person to develop an **analysis** of the challenges and opportunities foreseeable for this new funds development structure over the next three years, with said analysis **to be completed and reported on by May 1, 2015**. This analysis is to be reported in a document to be sent to members of the Executive Committee, and is to summarize findings regarding a) past trends, b) projected trends, c) possible new opportunities, d) work presently being done that is a candidate for “sunsetting.” This group is then to work with the Director and the Associate Director **to establish goals for work to be done**, with the goals to be **completed and reported by July 1**. These proposals were unanimously approved by the members of the executive committee, to be reported to and acted on by the entire committee. Vice Chair **Mindy Douglas** adjourned the executive committee meeting with prayer at 8:30 A.M.

8. Chair **Jeffrey Bullock** welcomed the committee again to the Cooper Room of the Erdman Center at Princeton Theological Seminary at 9:15 A.M. on Wednesday, February 25, 2015. Bullock asked Vice Chair **Mindy Douglas** to chair. Vice Chair Douglas called the meeting to order, and opened the meeting with prayer. Douglas then invited **Chip Hardwick** to introduce **Michelle Bartel**, the new Coordinator for Theological Education and Seminary Relations with the Presbyterian Mission Agency. Douglas invited members of the search committee to offer comments and congratulations. Bartel was invited to respond. Bartel was warmly welcomed by the committee.

**Plenary
convenes**

9. Vice Chair Douglas next opened the committee’s discussion of the Theological Education Fund Allocation Formula. Douglas recognized **Barbara Wheeler** and **Tony Ruger**, who joined the meeting by conference call. Wheeler and Ruger then made a presentation on the history of denominational funding of theological education, from the time of the predecessor denominations to the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), continuing through the reunion in 1983 of the United Presbyterian Church in the USA and the Presbyterian Church in the United States, noting that these two predecessor denominations had developed substantially different funding patterns which shaped the present allocation formula and continue to impact the lives of the seminaries themselves. Following the presentation, questions were asked and discussion followed. The committee expressed warm appreciation to Wheeler and Ruger for

**Discussion of TEF
Allocation formula
and history of
denominational
funding**

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
September 23-25, 2015
Theology, Formation and Evangelism Ministry Area

their presentation. Douglas adjourned at 11:17 A.M. and the committee worshiped with the seminary community at Miller Chapel.

10. Chair Jeffrey Bullock welcomed the committee to the Cooper Room of the Erdman Center at Princeton Theological Seminary at 1:15 P.M. The committee then engaged in an extended discussion of the TEF, the allocation formula, and the needs and possibilities of denominational funding of theological education in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) and the member institutions of the COTE.

Plenary convenes:
Discussion of TEF
Allocation

11. Bullock adourned the committee to meet in subcommittees at 3:20 P.M. The Implementation and Interpretation Subcommittee met in the Cooper Room of the Erdman Center; the Interschool and Mission Cooperation Subcommittee met in the Clark Room of the Erdman Center; the Theological And Church Concerns Subcommittee met in the Art Studio of the Erdman Center. Bullock noted that at 4:20 P.M. committee members were to move to meetings of the Presidents/Institutional Representatives, and the Institutional Support Committee.

Subcommittee
Meetings

12. At 4:20 P.M. the Presidents/Institutional Representatives convened in the Clark Room of the Erdman Center and the Institutional Support Committee convened in the Cooper Room of the Erdman Center. Both meetings adjourned at 5:15 P.M.

Committee
Meetings

13. The committee enjoyed dinner in the Main Lounge of the Mackay Center. Following dinner the committee celebrated four committee members who have concluded their service on COTE: Max Sherman, William Carl, Nancy Benson-Nicol, and Lee Hinson-Hasty.

Celebrating
Members
Concluding Service

Thursday, February 26

14. Chair Jeffrey Bullock called the meeting to order at 9:10 A.M. Bullock invited **Paul Roberts** to lead the committee in prayer.

Plenary convenes

15. Bullock called upon **William Scheu** to report on **developments at Columbia Theological Seminary**. Several members of the committee had attended the memorial service for Steve Hayner on Monday, February 23. Scheu reported on the manner in which the seminary community is walking with the Hayner family, absorbing this loss, and moving forward. Scheu reported that a Presidential Search Committee is hard at work. Scheu noted the sorrow surrounding the deaths of other faculty members.

Update on
Columbia
Seminary

16. Bullock called upon **Paul Roberts** to offer an **update on Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary**. Roberts made a presentation of new work underway and new directions being pursued.

Update on Johnson
C. Smith
Theological
Seminary

17. Bullock recognized **Mindy Douglas**, Chair of the **Nominating Committee**. On behalf of the Nominating Committee, Douglas moved

Election of TEF
Formula Task

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
September 23-25, 2015
Theology, Formation and Evangelism Ministry Area

the following nominations for the **2014-2016 TEF Formula Task Force:**
Elected Members (4): Matt Miles, Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, Tom Trinidad, and an elected member to be named (due to Nancy Ramsay's withdrawal from COTE); Institutional Representatives/Presidents (4): Ted Wardlaw, Craig Barnes, Frank Yamada, Katharine Rhodes Henderson; Seminary Support Network, Synod (2): Catreliia Hunter, Mid-Atlantic, and Liz McDowell, Northeast. The committee voted unanimously to approve.

Force

18. Douglas continued the Nominating Committee report by inviting discussion of the COTE Self-Study, which needs to be completed and reported to the 221st General Assembly in June of 2016. A proposal regarding carrying out the self-study is to be forthcoming. There was additional discussion about the need for COTE to name a representative to attend the Presbyterian Mission Agency Board meeting April 15-17, 2015.

Discussion: COTE
Self-Study for the
221st GA;
Presbyterian
Mission Agency
Board
Representative

19. Bullock called upon **Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, chair** of the **Interschool and Mission Cooperation Subcommittee**, to deliver its report. Cintrón-Olivieri reported that the subcommittee had extensive discussion of referrals from the General Assembly addressed to COTE, and the formulation of responses to those referrals. Cintrón-Olivieri then moved on behalf of the subcommittee that the following subcommittee members **be appointed as a task force to draft a response to the General Assembly referrals: Marianne Rhebergen, Chris Murphy, Chip Hardwick, and Michelle Bartel.** The motion was approved unanimously by voice vote.

Interschool and
Mission
Cooperation:
Responses to GA
Referrals

20. Bullock called upon **Paul Roberts, chair** of the **Implementation and Interpretation Subcommittee**, to deliver its report. Roberts opened by expressing gratitude for the members of the subcommittee and their work together. Roberts thanked **Nancy Benson-Nicol** for the information she provided about the **Seminary Support Network**. Roberts noted that a question had arisen about staff responsibilities – specifically, which staff persons would carry what responsibilities for the marketing of the Seminary Support Network. Roberts conveyed the subcommittee's urging that care be taken to attend to the process of establishing job responsibilities in the new structure, to be sure there is clarity in responsibilities.

Implementation
and Interpretation
Subcommittee

21. Bullock called upon **Kathy Wolf Reed, member** of the **Theological and Church Concerns Subcommittee**, to deliver its report. Reed reported that the subcommittee had **elected Brian Blount as its chair**. Reed and Blount reported that the subcommittee will be taking steps to orient its work on a response to a General Assembly referral (2010 Referral, Item 10-10, regarding compensation and equity).

Theological and
Church Concerns
Subcommittee

22. Bullock then reported on the **meeting of Seminary Presidents/Institutional Representatives**. The discussions within the committee had included time to share and debrief, as well as opportunity

Seminary
Presidents /
Institutional

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
September 23-25, 2015
Theology, Formation and Evangelism Ministry Area

to welcome **Doris J. Garcia-Rivera**, President of the Seminario Evangélico de Puerto Rico.

Representatives

23. Bullock called upon **Mary Elva Smith**, chair of the **Institutional Support Committee**, to deliver its report. Smith reported that the committee had reflected on work that it has done over the last few years. The committee had discussed the purpose of the Institutional Support Committee, and how its members might offer support. There was discussion of a new way of connecting with presidents and institutional representatives around prayer for those leaders and the institutions they serve. Committee members have committed to an **“adopt a president” program** that will seek ways to be of prayerful support to the presidents and institutional representatives. Members of the committee will, for a period of time, commit to pray for a particular president/institutional representative and their institution. This initiative will begin following this meeting.

Institutional Support Committee

24. Bullock next moved to a series of follow-up items as the meeting came to a close.

First, Bullock called for the committee to consider what decisions needed to be made in order to allow the **distribution of funds** from the Theological Education Fund to be initiated quickly. Discussion followed. Ted Wardlaw moved the following: **Direct the Presbyterian Foundation to handle the 10% per seminary distribution to Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary of the payouts from the proceeds of the TEF in 2014 and 2015 (except in cases where seminaries have already sent the 10%)**. Bill Carl seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

Motion: Tithe on TEF Distributions 2014-15

Bullock next noted that there will be a **debrief** of this meeting, to be done by the Chair and Vice-Chair in collaboration with the Coordinator for Theological Education and Seminary Relations and others as appropriate.

Debrief

Bullock thanked **Barry Ensign-George, Catherine Reuning, and Chip Hardwick** for work done on this meeting.

Thanks

Bullock thanked **Bill Scheu** for his work on the transition of funds development work to the Presbyterian Foundation.

Bullock offered a **warm welcome to Michelle Bartel** as she takes up the call to be Coordinator of Theological Education and Seminary Relations. Bullock invited Bartel to offer remarks, which she did.

Welcome

Bullock recognized Vice-Chair Mindy Douglas, who thanked the new members for their good work in this meeting, looking forward to work to come.

At 11:50 A.M. it was moved and seconded that the meeting adjourn following prayer. At Bullock’s invitation, **Gary Eller** offered prayer.

Adjourn

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
September 23-25, 2015
Theology, Formation and Evangelism Ministry Area

Respectfully submitted on February 26, 2015,

Jeffrey Bullock, Chair, Committee on Theological Education

Barry Ensign-George, Clerk