

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**

**February 3-5, 2016**

**Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries**

**ITEM D.102  
FOR ACTION**

<i>FOR PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S OFFICE USE ONLY</i>					
	A. Finance		E. Corporate Property, Legal, Finance		J. Board Nominating & Governance Subcommittee
	B. Justice		F. PC(USA), A Corporation		P. Plenary
	C. Leadership		G. Audit		
	D. Worshiping Communities		H. Executive Committee		

**Subject: Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries Responses to Referrals**

**Recommendation:**

**That the Presbyterian Mission Agency Board approve the Racial Ethnic and Women's Ministries portion of the Presbyterian Mission Agency report to the 222<sup>th</sup> GA (2016).**

**Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries**

**I. Referrals in Progress**

None.

**II. Final Responses to Referrals**

1. *2014 Referral: Item 08-05. Resolution to Define and Interpret Standards for PC (USA) Racial Ethnic Schools and Colleges. To Refer the Following Recommendation to the Already Established Racial Ethnic Schools and Colleges Presbyterian Mission Agency Board Task Force. The Committee Would Like the Task Force to Have at Least Six (6) People. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency, in Consultation with the Racial Ethnic Schools and Colleges Presidents Roundtable, to Convene a Racially Diverse Special Task Force of Six People with Expertise in the Field of Education to Define and Interpret the Standards for Racial Ethnic Schools Related to the PC(USA)—From the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 41, 489–91; p. 221 of the print copy).*

*Response:* A special task force, including racial ethnic schools and colleges presidents and other diverse leaders, met in the fall of 2014 to define and interpret the standards for racial ethnic schools related to the PC(USA). A report was presented to and approved by the Presbyterian Mission Agency Board at its April 2015 meeting. The report can be found on the Racial Ethnic Schools and Colleges website ([www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/resc/schools-colleges](http://www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/resc/schools-colleges)).

2. *2014 Referral: Item 08-06. A Resolution to Develop a Churchwide Antiracism Policy. Recommendation 1. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency, Using Existing Racial Ethnic Ministries, Consultation with the Racial Ethnic Ministries Task Force, the Advocacy Committee for Racial-Ethnic Concerns, the Advisory Committee on Social Witness Policy, and Engagement with Experienced Practitioners as Appropriate, to Update and Revise Churchwide Antiracism Policies and Develop Implementing Procedures Similar to the Existing Antidiscrimination Policies and Procedures—From the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 41, 491–95; pp. 221–22 of the print copy).*

*Response:* This referral is answered by “Facing Racism: A Vision of the Intercultural Community” refer to item (# to be inserted by OGA).

3. *2014 Referral: Item 08-06. A Resolution to Develop a Churchwide Antiracism Policy. Recommendation 2. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Develop and Implement Criteria for Evaluating the Effectiveness of Current Churchwide Antiracism Training Programs and to Report Back to the 222nd General Assembly (2016) Regarding Its Findings and Any Corrective Actions Taken or Proposed and Results Achieved—From the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 41, 491–95; pp. 221–22 of the print copy).*

*Response:* This referral is answered by “Evaluation of Current Churchwide Antiracism Trainings,” refer to item (# to be inserted by OGA). The Office of Research Services in collaboration with the Office of Gender and Racial Justice in a two-part process gathered feedback on PC(USA) antiracism trainings and also conducted interviews with antiracism trainers to evaluate the effectiveness of current churchwide antiracism trainings.

4. *2014 Referral: Item 08-06. A Resolution to Develop a Churchwide Antiracism Policy. Recommendation 5. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Develop Tools, Assessment Instruments, and Training Materials for the Presbyteries and Congregations in Order to Develop Clear and Effective Understanding of Systemic Racism, Including White Privilege, Power, and Prejudice in Relation to Race—From the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 41, 491–95; pp. 221–22 of the print copy).*

*Response:* Training materials and assessment tools on antiracism have been developed and revised. These materials include modules on white privilege, power, and prejudice. These training materials are available for presbyteries and congregations. Staff from the office of Gender and Racial Justice are available to visit presbyteries and congregations to offer training and/or to train antiracism trainers. An antiracism trainer is available to train groups in the church. The antiracism manual is available for trained facilitators.

5. *2014 Referral: Item 08-10. Measure for Measure: Assessing the Effectiveness of Hearing and Singing New Songs to God. Recommendation 1. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Plan a Women of Color Consultation (WoCC) That Focuses on the Inclusion of Women of Color of All Ages in Leadership and Decision-Making in Presbyteries and Synods and/or Their Successor Bodies. The Next WoCC Shall Be Held No Later Than the Fall of 2015 and Be Reported to the 222nd General Assembly (2016) with Recommendation for Further Action and Study—From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 42, 518–22; p. 224 of the print copy).*

*Response:* This referral is answered by “Empowered and Hopeful: Women of Color Consultation Report,” refer to item (# to be inserted by OGA). A planning team working with the Office of Women’s Leadership Development and Young Women’s Ministries and the Office of Gender and Racial Justice in Racial Ethnic & Women’s Ministries met to plan the Women of Color Consultation, which was held on November 12-14, 2015, in Greensboro, NC.

6. *2014 Referral: Item 08-10. Measure for Measure: Assessing the Effectiveness of Hearing and Singing New Songs to God. Recommendation 2. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Make Available Print and Electronic Resources on Cultural Competency, Antiracism, and Antisexism to Mid Councils and the Larger Church—From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 42, 518–22; p. 224 of the print copy).*

*Response:* Print and electronic resources on cultural competency, antiracism, and antisexism are available to mid councils and the larger church through the Office of Gender and Racial Justice in the Presbyterian Mission Agency. Staff from the office of Gender and Racial Justice are available to visit presbyteries and congregations to train individual antiracism trainers or teams of trainers. An antiracism trainer is available to train groups in the church. The antiracism manual is available for trained facilitators.

7. *2014 Referral: Item 08-10. Measure for Measure: Assessing the Effectiveness of Hearing and Singing New Songs to God. Recommendation 4. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Collect Information from Mid Councils on the Implementation of Cultural Competency, Antiracism, and Antisexism Training for Committees on Ministry and Committees on Preparation for Ministry and to Report Its Findings to the 222nd General Assembly (2016) —From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 42, 518–22; p. 224 of the print copy).*

*Response:* This referral is answered by “Implementation of Cultural Competency, Antiracism and Antisexism Trainings in Mid Councils Report,” refer to item (# to be inserted by OGA). The Office of

Gender and Racial Justice collected information from mid councils on the implementation of cultural competency, antiracism and antisexism trainings in mid councils.

8. *2014 Referral: Item 09-11. Affirming the Importance of Maternal and Child Nutrition over 1000 Days. Recommendation 4. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to work with Presbyterian Women in Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), Inc., to identify resources for Presbyterians to learn more about maternal and child nutrition—From the Presbytery of National Capital (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 15, 38, 649–50; pp. 241–42 of the print copy).*

*Response:* The Office of Gender and Racial Justice in Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries have collaborated with Presbyterian Women in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) to identify resources for Presbyterians to learn more about maternal and child nutrition. Information on the maternal and child nutrition in the first 1000 days movement can be found on the Gender Justice website ([www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/gender-justice-ministries](http://www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/gender-justice-ministries)), Presbyterian Women's website ([www.presbyterianwomen.org/justice](http://www.presbyterianwomen.org/justice)), and on the AllWomen in the Church website ([www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/all-women](http://www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/all-women)).

9. *2014 Referral: Item 09-14. National Racial Ethnic Ministries Task Force Report. Recommendation 1. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency (PMA) and the Office of the General Assembly (OGA) to Hold a National Consultation on Developing Regional Racial Ethnic Ministries in 2015 for Twenty-Five Participants Over a Two-Day Period. This Consultation Will Have a Planning Team of Ten People and Shall Include Developing a Vision and Structure so Each Ministry May Create Its Own Unique Way of Doing Ministry—From the Task Force on National Racial Ethnic Ministries (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 15, 38, 655–59; p. 243; p. 243 of the print copy).*

*Response:* Twenty-five leaders from across the United States gathered in Louisville, Kentucky, on May 27-29, 2015, for a national consultation on developing regional racial ethnic ministries. The consultation leaders developed a resource for congregations and mid councils to use on developing regional racial ethnic ministries. The resource was shared with participants in a workshop at the 2015 Polity Conference, sponsored by the Office of the General Assembly, in October 2015 in Portland, Oregon. The resource can be found on the Intercultural Ministries website ([www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/intercultural-ministries/further-study](http://www.presbyterianmission.org/ministries/intercultural-ministries/further-study)).

10. *2014 Referral: Item 09-14. National Racial Ethnic Ministries Task Force Report. Recommendation 3. Call for a Churchwide Conference on Race, Ethnicity, Racism, and Ethnocentricity in 2015. In Addition, Direct the Moderator of the 221st General Assembly (2014) of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) to Appoint a Planning Team of Ten People For This Event in Consultation with Groups Named in a. Through f; g. A Report Will Be Submitted to the 222nd General Assembly (2016) on These Matters—From the Task Force on National Racial Ethnic Ministries (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 15, 38, 655–59; p. 243 of the print copy).*

*Response:* This referral is answered by “Churchwide Conversation on Race, Ethnicity, Racism and Ethnocentricity Report,” refer to item (# to be inserted by OGA). The Moderator of the 221<sup>st</sup> General Assembly (2014) of the PC(USA) appointed a planning team of ten people to facilitate the planning of this churchwide conversation, which was held Nov. 5-7, 2015, in Stony Point, NY.

11. *2014 Referral: Item 09-17. The Self-Study Report of the Advocacy Committee for Women's Concerns of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) to the 221st General Assembly (2014). Recommendation 6. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Uphold the Instruction Given by the 205th General Assembly*

(1993) to Ensure Programmatic Advocacy: “Under the Leadership of Those Working in the Areas of Racial Ethnic Ministries and Women’s Ministries, ... Ensure Advocacy and Monitoring Functions ... Throughout the Ministries and Agencies of the General Assembly—From the Advocacy Committee on Women’s Concerns (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 15, 39, 696–735; p. 252 of the print copy).

*Response:* Racial Ethnic & Women’s Ministries’ staff meet regularly with the Advocacy Committee for Women’s Concerns (ACWC) and with the Associate for Advocacy Committee Support to ensure programmatic advocacy and empowerment for women. Racial Ethnic & Women’s Ministries engaged in programmatic advocacy at the United Nations Commission on the Status of Women, the Presbyterian Women Churchwide Gathering, the African American Clergywomen’s Gathering, the Native American Women’s Gathering, the Study on the Status of Women Theological Consultation, the Women of Color Consultation, and in racial ethnic and women’s leadership institutes. Racial Ethnic & Women’s Ministries also held several women’s listening visits across the country and shared its findings with the Advocacy Committee for Women’s Concerns at a meeting held in 2015, and with the Study on the Status of Women Theological Consultation planning team at the theological consultation in the fall of 2015. The ministry area in collaboration with the Office of Research Services and the Advocacy Committee for Women’s Concerns is also working together to study the status of women. Racial Ethnic & Women’s staff also led a national Staff Development Day workshop with an ACWC member and the Associate for Advocacy Committee Support in Louisville, Kentucky, in November 2015. Ecumenical and interfaith conversations surrounding issues of gender and race also took place at the Women of Color in Ministry event, the White Privilege Conference, and the United Nations Commission on the Status of Women.

12. 2014 Referral: Item 14-04. Racial Ethnic & New Immigrant Church Growth Consultation Committee Report. Recommendation 3. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency and the Office of the General Assembly to Collaborate with Mid Councils to Establish Regional Certified Ministry Training Programs to Prepare Racial Ethnic and Immigrant Church Members to Serve Worshiping Communities—From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 44, 46–52, 1000–09; p. 316 of the print copy).

*Response:* Staff in Racial Ethnic & Women’s Ministries and the Coordinator for Mid Council Relations in the Office of the General Assembly collaborated with mid council leaders on the establishment of regional certified training program for racial ethnic and immigrant leaders. Representatives from mid councils and leaders from across the country met in Rock Island, Illinois, in 2015 to determine current training opportunities in the church for racial ethnic and immigrant leaders serving worshiping communities. The meeting between the Presbyterian Mission Agency, Office of the General Assembly and mid council leaders was a helpful collaboration. The group concluded that there are many resources currently available for regional certified ministry training programs, such as the Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary training for commissioned ruling elders, offered in Spanish ([www.austinseminary.edu/page.cfm?p=3189](http://www.austinseminary.edu/page.cfm?p=3189)) and/or the Theocademy program of the Synod of Mid America ([synodma.org/theocademy](http://synodma.org/theocademy)), which provides web-based training resources.

13. 2014 Referral: Item 14-04. Racial Ethnic & New Immigrant Church Growth Consultation Committee Report. Recommendation 5. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency and Mid Councils to Create a Network of Racial Ethnic and New Immigrant Coaches Trained to Address the Culturally Specific Needs of Racial Ethnic and New Immigrant Congregations—From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 44, 46–52, 1000–09; p. 316 of the print copy).

*Response:* Racial ethnic and new immigrant congregational leaders were recruited and invited to attend the Racial Ethnic and New Immigrants Coaches Training held November 11-13, 2015, in Greensboro,

North Carolina. Twenty-two racial ethnic and new immigrant leaders attended the training. This gathering of African, African American, Hispanic/Latino-a, Korean, Asian, Middle Eastern, Native American, and Portuguese-language coaches discussed how to address the culture- and language-specific needs of the racial ethnic and new immigrant congregations and leaders whom they will provide coaching for. These coaches are planning to work in collaboration with mid council leaders and with Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries staff to support the growth, sustainability, and transformation of new and existing racial ethnic, bilingual, and intercultural worshipping communities.

*14. 2014 Referral: Item 14-04. Racial Ethnic & New Immigrant Church Growth Consultation Committee Report. Recommendation 6. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency, the Office of the General Assembly, and the Mid Councils to Consult with Each Other to Consider Expanding the Criteria for Accepting the Ordination Credentials of New Immigrant Leaders—From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp. 44, 46–52, 1000–09; p. 316 of the print copy).*

*Response:* The Coordinator for Intercultural Ministries in Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries, the Coordinator for Mid Council Relations in the Office of the General Assembly, and mid council leaders consulted in 2015 on expanding the criteria for accepting the ordination credentials of new immigrant leaders in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.). The group focused on G-2.0505 a. (1) in the *Book of Order* of the PC(USA) on the "Transfer of Ministers of Other Denominations," which reads, "In the case of ministers for immigrant fellowships and congregations, a presbytery may, if it determines that its strategy for mission with that group requires it, recognize the ordination and receive as a member of presbytery a new immigrant minister who furnishes evidence of good standing in a denomination, even though at the time of enrollment that minister lacks the educational history required of candidates, and provide such educational opportunities as seem necessary and prudent for that minister's successful ministry in the presbytery." The group reminds the church that this gives great latitude to presbyteries to expand the criteria for accepting the ordination credentials of a teaching elder of an immigrant fellowship or congregation, and it also calls upon presbyteries to continue the education of that leader, as needed, for her/his successful ministry in the presbytery. The group determined that it will remind presbyteries of G-2.0505 a. (1) in the *Book of Order* and will share resources, as needed, to presbyteries who are working with new immigrant leaders on ordination.

### **III. Reports with Recommendations (submitted under separate cover)**

### **IV. Reports without Recommendations**

#### **1. Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Current Churchwide Antiracism Trainings Report**

Report to the 222<sup>nd</sup> General Assembly (2016)

#### **Background:**

*2014 Referral: Item 08-06. A Resolution to Develop a Churchwide Antiracism Policy. Recommendation 2. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Develop and Implement Criteria for Evaluating the Effectiveness of Current Churchwide Antiracism Training Programs and to Report Back to the 222nd General Assembly (2016) Regarding Its Findings and Any Corrective Actions Taken or Proposed and Results Achieved—From the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 41, 491–95; pp. 221–22 of the print copy).*

The Presbyterian Mission Agency in developing and implementing criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of churchwide antiracism training worked in collaboration with the Office of Research Services in the Presbyterian Mission Agency. Research Services conducted a survey of participants (and those invited to participate) in antiracism trainings held at the 221<sup>st</sup> General Assembly (2014) and at the 2011 and 2013 Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) Big Tents. These trainings were offered by the Office of Gender and Racial Justice in Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries.

Research services could find no record of persons who participated in the 221<sup>st</sup> General Assembly (2014) antiracism trainings, so the entire population of individuals who had the opportunity to participate in the trainings were invited to respond to the survey. In addition, those who participated in antiracism trainings at the PC(USA)'s Big Tents in 2011 and 2013 were invited to take the survey. Research Services, also, received feedback from those who have participated in similar antiracism trainings elsewhere and those who have never participated in any antiracism trainings.

This evaluation of current churchwide antiracism trainings involved a web-based survey of persons participating (or invited to participate) in antiracism trainings and also a series of interviews were conducted with antiracism trainers. Thus, persons who have participated in antiracism trainings, persons who were invited to participate in trainings, and the trainers themselves were included in this research.

### **Survey Respondents:**

A total of 855 persons were invited to participate in the survey, of which 73 had invalid email addresses. And, a total of 248 people from this population completed the survey (32 percent of those receiving an email invitation to participate in the survey).

Sixteen percent of respondents indicated that they participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings. (Of these, 21 percent participated within the past year, 42 percent participated one to three years ago, 26 percent participated more than three years ago, and 11 percent do not remember when they participated in the training).

### **Impact of PC(USA) Antiracism Trainings (Summary):**

Those who participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings were asked what ongoing personal impact the training had on them. 69 percent responded that PC(USA) antiracism training has impacted their personal attitudes about racism. 60 percent responded that the training has impacted their understanding of what racism means. 54 percent responded that the training has impacted their personal attitudes about white people and 49 percent responded that the training has impacted their personal attitudes about people of color.

Seventy-six percent of participants agree with the information presented in the antiracism training in which they participated. 66 percent felt it was worth their time. And, a minority (24 percent) felt that antiracism training was focused on making white people feel ashamed for being born white.

### **Observations:**

In answering questions designed to measure more subtle forms of racism prevalent in society, awareness scores of those who took PC(USA) antiracism trainings do not differ significantly from the scores of the other respondents.

The respondents who have taken PC(USA) antiracism trainings are significantly more likely to agree with the statement that race is a social construct, compared to those who took similar trainings elsewhere or those with no training. Between these groups, there are no significant differences in agreement or disagreement of the other statements in the survey.

Overall, 51 percent of respondents say they are doing some work to dismantle white privilege. Those who have participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings responded that they feel significantly more empowered to address white privilege. Respondents generally agree that white privilege is not a myth, that it bothers them, and that they try to be cognizant of it.

Those who have taken PC(USA) antiracism trainings are significantly more likely than those who have never had antiracism training to say they have been accused of racism (54 percent of antiracism participants versus 32 percent of those with no training).

These findings seem to indicate that those who have taken PC(USA) antiracism trainings are more aware of racism and more willing to address their racism. Those who have participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings are significantly more likely to say they have confronted someone for saying or doing something racist.

### **Survey Results:**

#### **Goals:**

*The Building the Beloved Community: A Training Manual for Antiracism Facilitators* (4th edition, 2014), states the goals of antiracism training as follows:

*The goal of antiracism work is to help people recognize the relationship between conscious and subconscious beliefs and behavior at the cultural and institutional levels. This will enable them to understand how oppressive social behavior is institutionalized and perpetuated in the values, beliefs, structures and institutions of society. If the foundational beliefs and values of a society are biased against a segment of the population based on racial characteristics, a racist or race-based system of oppression will result. Understanding this connection will enable people to see how their own attitudes and behavior are influenced by prevailing racial norms. This is called deconstruction -- understanding how something is put together is a prerequisite for dismantling it. This is the beginning of the change process.*

The survey indicates that the PC(USA)'s antiracism trainings are achieving their goals in some respects, but are still falling short. Those who have participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings generally feel that the experience has had the greatest impact on: (1) their personal attitudes about racism, and (2) their understanding of what racism means. However, there is no difference in overall racism awareness between those who took the trainings and those who did not.

Also, only 59 percent of those who participated in PC(USA) trainings feel that the training has had an impact on their understanding of how racism operates systematically in the United States today.



**Challenges:**

Part of the challenge is that the PC(USA) antiracism training was originally designed to be an 8-hour training scheduled for 1-2 days. The time scheduled for trainings has been cut back, as most organizations have been reticent to give this much time to antiracism training. The training at the 221st General Assembly (2014) and at the 220th General Assembly (2012), for example, was scheduled for 45 minutes. To increase the training time, the trainers offered two 45 minute sessions (1½ hours total) in 2012 and named them part I and part II, encouraging commissioners and others to stay for both parts. At the 221st General Assembly in 2014, only an overview of antiracism could be offered in the two 45 minutes trainings offered. It is difficult to help participants understand how institutional racism and white privilege operates in the United States in such a short timeframe.

Even so, the Office of Gender and Racial Justice has seen signs of increased interest and requests for antiracism and cultural humility (formerly named “cultural proficiency”) trainings in the last few years. For example, in 2014 and 2015, Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary requested that staff from the Office of Gender and Racial Justice provide training to its incoming class of seminarians as part of their orientation. This training was scheduled for 3 hours. Also, the Presbyterian Mission Agency Board dedicated a full day of its board meeting this fall to cultural humility training. This training was scheduled for 7 hours, not including the lunch break. Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries staff have also offered trainings at churches and conferences, including the Big Tent 2009, 2011, 2013 and 2015, and worship-based resources have been shared with the larger church, following high profile racial justice cases in the nation in 2014 and 2015. A Cultural Humility Team was created in the Presbyterian Mission Agency, and in 2015, it offered a Mission Staff Cultural Humility Day, a Strategy and Coordination Leadership Team Cultural Humility Day, training at a Presbyterian Mission Agency Board meeting (as referenced above), cultural humility was a major focus of an All Staff Mission and Budget Update, and the team has advised the Human Resources area in offering ongoing trainings.

Another area of concern is the significant minority of PC(USA) participants (24 percent) who feel that antiracism trainings focus on making white people feel ashamed for being born white. These respondents are, in large part, also the same respondents who did not feel that antiracism trainings were worth their time and who did not agree with the information the trainings provided. Of individuals who attended antiracism trainings and also those who did not attend any antiracism trainings but participated in the survey, about one out of every four respondents are resistant to its message, in part because they have yet to be convinced there is a problem. This minority is contrasted with 74 percent of respondents who agree that racial discrimination is still a problem in the United States. Nevertheless, 28 percent of these respondents also believe that people of color are too quick to blame racism for their problems, and 39 percent of them think the media makes things out to be about race when it is really not about this.

A challenge also lies in people's attitudes about racism in general. Those who think that people of color are too quick to blame racism for their problems are more likely to rate lower on the racism awareness scale. And, they are also more likely to believe that the best way to end racial inequality is to ignore race. These findings point to a potential focusing of antiracism trainings. In other words, it may be fruitful to focus on the dynamics of “colorblind racism” in future antiracism trainings, that is just because some choose to disregard racial characteristics in their everyday lives and decision-making, thus seemingly providing the grounds for people to be treated equally, does not mean that racism and white privilege has gone away. This simply allows persons to ignore institutional racism and the disadvantages and lack of opportunities for people of color to fully flourish and live out their calls in the

church and society.

Although attitudes about racism vary, understanding of what race is remains consistent. PC(USA) antiracism trainings have successfully educated participants on the meaning of race as a social construct. People who participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings generally understand that race is not biological, that it is a human construct. However, what is distressing is that these same people are not taking the next step towards understanding what a social construct is. This difficulty in understanding, however, is much less pronounced in those who participated in PC(USA) antiracism trainings than with those who did not.

Respondents reported that the PC(USA)'s antiracism trainings are influencing their actions. Those who took PC(USA) antiracism trainings are significantly less likely to say they don't know what they can do about white privilege, and are significantly more likely to say they have confronted someone for saying or doing something racist.

One of the most significant findings of this research is that older adults, those with less education, and those who self-identify politically as independents are the least aware of racism and its systemic impacts. Thus, for greater impact when considering which specific populations within the church to invite to participate in antiracism trainings, inviting these groups specifically may provide good opportunities for learning. Or, it may be a better investment to focus energies on the groups that are more aware of racism and its systemic impacts and ask these groups to join the antiracism movement, such as young adults, for example, many of whom have come of age in a more intercultural society.

### **Results of Interviews of Antiracism Trainers (Summary):**

As stated earlier, this research involved a web-based survey of persons participating (or invited to participate) in antiracism trainings. A second part of the research was to conduct a series of interviews with antiracism trainers. The trainers interviewed were generally happy with the PC(USA)'s antiracism and cultural humility trainings and indicated that they are committed to these trainings in the church. It had been 17 years since the Presbyterian Mission Agency (formerly the General Assembly Council) held an introduction to antiracism training. Antiracism training was first held at its 1997 meeting, and the agency recommended that an introduction to antiracism training also be planned for commissioners to the 211th General Assembly (1999). After 17 years of training in the church, the antiracism trainers offered the following observations for future trainings:

1. The PC(USA) will need to set more realistic goals for antiracism and cultural humility trainings.
2. The PC(USA) will need to make antiracism and cultural humility trainings a higher priority.
3. Not only individuals, but teams will need to be trained to facilitate future antiracism and cultural humility trainings.
4. Congregations, mid-councils, and agencies will need to have trainers check back in with them after the training to provide support.
5. Encourage congregations, mid-councils, and agencies to join existing antiracism organizations, partner with others, and share what they've learned through the web or through national gatherings.
6. The language used to describe antiracism and cultural humility trainings should suggest and provide opportunities for mutual learning.
7. As the church moves into a new era, some new activities and presentations (some of which we have been using) will need to be added to the antiracism manual to replace older exercises and

modules. Also, the antiracism manual will need to be updated to reflect recent advances in research and language.

8. As organizations are requesting trainings be held in less time than originally designed by the antiracism manual, the manual will need to be adapted to provide facilitators and trainers with direction on how to adapt the activities and presentations for different timeframes, in order to reduce the trainer's preparation time. And, the training design will also need to have an intentional directional flow.

9. Also, as less time is being offered for trainings, there should be guidelines for prioritizing which activities and presentations need to be covered, at a minimum, during the trainings.

10. Develop an antiracism curriculum for use at the local level that will be available at no cost to congregations and mid-councils. Or, receive permission from Presbyterian Women in the PC(USA) and the resource writer to adopt their newest antiracism curriculum created by an antiracism trainer entitled, *Becoming the Beloved Community*, available with or without a DVD and available through Presbyterian Distribution Service. Packet with DVD is item PWR10045, \$24.95 plus shipping. Packet without DVD is item PWR10046, \$14.95 plus shipping.

### **Future Directions for Antiracism and Cultural Humility Trainings:**

The foundation has been laid by the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) to engage in antiracism and cultural humility trainings. 17 years ago, the church created an antiracism policy, *Facing Racism: A Vision of the Beloved Community*. This report evaluating the effectiveness of current churchwide antiracism trainings is presented to the 222<sup>nd</sup> General Assembly (2016) with the hope that commitment to implementing antiracism and cultural humility trainings in the church will result in a new vision and recommitment to building an antiracism organization and living into the vision of God's intercultural community.

Racism and white privilege exist in the church and in society. Racism is the "interlocking systems of advantage (as well as disadvantage) based on race. Unless we learn to recognize the interlocking effects of privilege at these levels we will not recognize how easily some of us enjoy privileges because of our racial identity that are not equally available to all our neighbors."[\[1\]](#)

Systemic racism has significantly impacted the society and the church for many years in the ways we gather for worship, the ways we function and relate as the Body of Christ, and the ways we build trust and engage individually with one another. Racism has directly or indirectly influenced the allocation of limited resources for mission, the staffing of leadership positions within the church, the calling of leaders to serve in local congregations, as well as the process of ordination and preparation towards ordered ministry.

The 220th General Assembly (2012) received and approved the Climate for Change Task Force report and approved the recommendation made that "cultural proficiency and anti-racism training be mandatory for all employees of all six agencies, and provide periodic or continuing education courses or training in this area, which will be monitored by the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns."[\[2\]](#)

As a country, we have made progress regarding the understanding of race and the reality of racism. However, there is still staggering evidence of the continuing reality of white privilege—as seen in comparisons of wealth, education, health care, and mortality rates between the so-called races in the United States.[\[3\]](#) As long as this disparity exists, the church must continue antiracism training and so bear witness to the conviction that all people are made in God's good image.

While some progress has been made in society at large, the church continues to struggle. In some locations within the church, there is little evidence that the sin of racism has been identified or that privilege and power are appropriately shared between people of different “races.”

The Confession of Belhar affirms that “the church must therefore stand by people in any form of suffering and need, which implies, among other things, that the church must witness against and strive against any form of injustice, so that justice may roll down like waters, and righteousness like an ever-flowing stream; that the church as the possession of God must stand where the Lord stands, namely against injustice and with the wronged; that in following Christ the church must witness against all the powerful and privileged who selfishly seek their own interests and thus control and harm others.”<sup>[4]</sup>

---

<sup>[1]</sup> Nancy J. Ramsay, “Why Is It so Difficult to Talk about Racism?” *The Thoughtful Christian Racism Study Pack*, 2009.

<sup>[2]</sup> Climate for Change Task Force, “Privilege, Power and Policy: The Church as an Employer,” Item 11-17 from the 220th General Assembly (2012), *Minutes*, 2012, Part I, pp. 1091ff (electronic version).

<sup>[3]</sup> Thomas Shapiro, Tatjana Meschede, Sam Osoro, “The Roots of the Widening Racial Wealth Gap: Explaining the Black-White Economic Divide,” Brandeis University, Institute on Assets and Social Policy, <[http://iasp.brandeis.edu/pdfs/2013/Roots\\_of\\_Widening\\_RWG.pdf](http://iasp.brandeis.edu/pdfs/2013/Roots_of_Widening_RWG.pdf)> (23 January 2014); Rakesh Kochar, Richard Fry, Paul Taylor, “Twenty to One: Wealth Gaps Rise to Record Highs Between Whites, Blacks and Hispanics,” Pew Research Center 2011 <[http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/files/2011/07/SDT-Wealth-Report\\_7-26-11\\_FINAL.pdf](http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/files/2011/07/SDT-Wealth-Report_7-26-11_FINAL.pdf)> (23 January 2014) ; Ed. Chanelle P. Hardy, Esq., “National Urban League 2013 Equality Index” in *2013 State of Black America: Redeem the Dream*, (National Urban League: 2013), 12–59. <<http://iamempowered.com/node/74570>> (23 January 2014).

<sup>[4]</sup> *Confession of Belhar*, adopted by Synod of the Dutch Reformed Mission Church in South Africa September 1986.

## 2. Implementation of Cultural Competency, Antiracism and Antisexism Trainings in Mid Councils Report

Report to the 222<sup>nd</sup> General Assembly (2016)

### Background:

*2014 Referral: Item 08-10. Measure for Measure: Assessing the Effectiveness of Hearing and Singing New Songs to God. Recommendation 4. Direct the Presbyterian Mission Agency to Collect Information from Mid Councils on the Implementation of Cultural Competency, Antiracism, and Antisexism Training for Committees on Ministry and Committees on Preparation for Ministry and to Report Its Findings to the 222nd General Assembly (2016) —From the Presbyterian Mission Agency (Minutes, 2014, Part I, pp.14, 42, 518–22; p. 224 of the print copy).*

The 221<sup>st</sup> General Assembly (2014) directed the Presbyterian Mission Agency to develop and implement criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of current churchwide antiracism trainings and to collect information from mid councils on the implementation of cultural competency, antiracism and antisexism trainings for committees on ministry and committees on preparation for ministry, and to report its findings to the 222<sup>nd</sup> General Assembly (2016).

The Office of Gender and Racial Justice in the Presbyterian Mission Agency contacted the 171 presbyteries and 16 synods in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) to inquire if their committees on ministries and committees on preparation for ministry had engaged in cultural competency, antiracism and/or antisexism training. The question sent to the mid councils was: “If your committees on ministries and committees on preparation for ministry have held cultural competency, antiracism and antisexism trainings?” This survey of mid councils involved an initial email sent to the mid councils, followed up by phone calls for those who did not respond to the email. The mid councils were quite responsive, returning the information in a timely manner. Their responses provided valuable information in whether or not mid councils implement these kinds of trainings, and what the ramifications are for people of color, women, and marginalized groups when mid councils are not aware of bias or privilege when it comes to ordination and preparation towards ordered ministries.

### Survey Responses:

A total of 171 presbyteries were surveyed, of which nearly 45 percent responded, representing 76 presbyteries. Of the 76, a total of 68 presbyteries reported that they had engaged in *no* cultural competency, antiracism and/or antisexism trainings. This represents 90 percent of the respondents. Seven of the presbyteries responded affirmatively, reporting *yes*, that they had engaged in either cultural competency, antiracism or antisexism trainings. Of the respondents, this represents nearly 9 percent. One presbytery refused to provide an answer to the question, representing less than 1 percent.

To provide a little more analysis, the presbyteries that reported that no trainings occurred in their committees on ministries or committees on preparation for ministry, said that conversations on these matters have taken place or are in the process of being planned. However, many of these are not specifically with committees on ministries or committees on preparation on ministry.

A report by the General Assembly Committee on Representation in 2014, reported that of the 16 synods in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), a total of 7 synods reported that they had engaged in *no* cultural competency or antiracism trainings. Four of the synods responded affirmatively, reporting *yes*, that they had engaged in either cultural competency or antiracism trainings. Five synods provided no

report.

**Observations:**

Overall, the majority of the committees on ministries or committees on preparation on ministry in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) have not engaged in cultural competency, antiracism and/or antisexism trainings. This survey may seemingly indicate that 90 percent of these committees in mid councils may not recognize, see the need for, or agree that racism, gender bias, or discrimination is a problem in their candidates' ordination or call processes. Or they may have not had the resources to provide such training, and in some cases, this may be on a mid council's "to do" list. If it is true that committees on ministry or committees on preparation for ministry do not believe that there are problems in the church related to racism and sexism, this may, in fact, perpetuate discrimination. Just because some people chose to disregard racial characteristics or gender differences in their every day lives and decision-making, does not mean that racism, sexism and/or white privilege has gone away. This simply allows persons to ignore racism, sexism and disadvantages for people of color, women and/or new immigrants in the church. This also may mean that individuals in these groups, which are often marginalized, are unable to fully live out their calls in the church and society.

The reason for antiracism, antisexism and cultural humility trainings is to combat issues that have been reported by women of color and those who work with women of color in ministry, such as that:

1. Persons of color, especially women of color, seeking ordained ministry in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), face difficulty navigating the call system; and
2. Persons of color, especially women of color, are subject to frequent and various forms of discrimination.

Antiracism trainings have successfully educated participants on the meaning of race as a social construct, and antisexism trainings help us to be aware and counter gender bias. Cultural humility trainings highlight cultural differences and explore tools for antiracism, in order to build and deepen culturally diverse relationships that lead to personal transformation and impact organizational change.

Findings in surveys on the benefit of PC(USA) antiracism and antisexism trainings seem to indicate that those who have taken these trainings are more aware of racism and sexism, and are more willing to address their racism. Those who have participated in PC(USA) antiracism and cultural humility trainings are significantly more likely to say they have confronted someone for saying or doing something racist or sexist.

In 2014, Racial Ethnic & Women's Ministries conducted Women's Listening Visits with PC(USA) women leaders in different geographical areas throughout the country. Some of the findings were:

1. That trainings for committees on ministry and committees on preparation for ministry "on how to talk with and treat women in ministry and women candidates is crucial, and it is important for committees on ministry and committees on preparation for ministry to become aware of the disparity between the treatment of men and women candidates."
2. That "our denomination's current standards and practices for approving candidates for ordination leaves little room and creates a difficult road for candidates whose cultural and/or educational background does not fit."
3. That there are "silos of cultural groups in the PC(USA) and the presbyteries," and "structural inflexibility limits options such as the ordination of immigrant pastors and new pastors who have not yet received a call";
4. That the "culture of the PCUSA is a hindrance to diversity" and that there is a need to "facilitate

conversations and feedback on national, local and presbytery levels dealing with the needs of racial ethnic communities”; *and*

5. That racial ethnic women are not receiving as many calls to serve as solo pastors or heads of staff in congregations as others in the church are, and sometimes, women of color “do not feel supported by male pastors in their presbyteries, and they often have to survive on their own.”

### Conclusion:

The 221<sup>st</sup> General Assembly (2014) urged mid councils to provide training and education on cultural competency, antiracism, and antisexism to its committees on ministry and committees on preparation for ministry with an expectation that issues which are addressed in this training will be disseminated throughout the presbytery at least once every three years beginning in 2015 Item 08-10, Recommendation 3. If our findings are accurate, then the majority of the presbyteries have not yet responded to this urging by the General Assembly.

Also, the 220th General Assembly (2012) received and approved the Climate for Change Task Force report and approved the recommendation made that “cultural proficiency and anti-racism training be mandatory for all employees of all six agencies, and provide periodic or continuing education courses or training in this area, which will be monitored by the Advocacy Committee for Racial Ethnic Concerns.”<sup>[1]</sup>

As long as disparity exists, the church must continue antiracism, antisexism and cultural humility trainings, and bear witness to the conviction that all people are made in God's good image.

---

<sup>[1]</sup> Nancy J. Ramsay, “Why Is It so Difficult to Talk about Racism?” *The Thoughtful Christian Racism Study Pack*, 2009.