

ITEM C.209
FOR INFORMATION

COMMITTEE ON THEOLOGICAL EDUCATION (COTE)
Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)
Minutes
Charlotte, North Carolina, September 16–18, 2013

1. The meeting of the Committee on Theological Education (COTE) was held September 16–18, 2013, in Charlotte, North Carolina, and hosted by the Union Presbyterian Seminary on its extension campus in Charlotte shared with Sharon Presbyterian Church.

2. **The following persons attended, constituting a quorum:**
Members: Alan Bancroft, Brian Blount (Union Presbyterian Seminary), William Carl (Pittsburgh Theological Seminary), Jana Childers (San Francisco Theological Seminary), Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, Mindy Douglas, Stephen Hayner (Columbia Theological Seminary), José Irizarry, Michael Jinkins (Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary), Matthew Miles, Nancy Ramsay (Presbyterian Mission Agency Board liaison), Kathy Wolf Reed (chair), Paul Roberts (Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary), Max Sherman, Chandler Stokes, Glen Snider (Presbyterian Mission Agency Board liaison), Theodore Wardlaw (Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary), Frank Yamada (McCormick Theological Seminary), and Nicholas Yoda

Covenant Member: Katherine Henderson (Auburn Theological Seminary)
Corresponding Member: Gary Eller (Omaha Presbyterian Seminary Foundation)

Staff from the Office of Theological Education: Lee Hinson-Hasty (coordinator) and Rose Eileen Niles (associate)
Adjunct Staff: Timothy Cargal (Office of the General Assembly) and Charles B. Hardwick (Presbyterian Mission Agency, director of Theology, Worship, and Education)

Union Presbyterian Seminary Guests: Richard Boyce (faculty and dean-elect, Charlotte campus), Thomas Currie (dean, Charlotte campus), Richard Hodde (board member), Sandy Irby (staff), Terry Johns (staff), William Rikard (board chair), Rodney Sadler (faculty)
Other Guests: Olanda Carr (Presbyterian Foundation), Laura Mariko Cheifetz (Presbyterian Publishing Corporation), Jomaris DeJesus (Presbyterian Mission Agency), David Esterline (McCormick Theological Seminary), Sharon Miller (Auburn Theological Seminary), Neal Presa (moderator, 220th General Assembly), James Thomas (Seminary Support Network representative, Presbytery of Charlotte), and Floretta Watkins (moderator, Presbytery of Charlotte)

3. **Excused Absences:** Craig Barnes (Princeton Theological Seminary), Jeffrey Bullock (University of Dubuque Theological Seminary), James McDonald (San Francisco Theological Seminary), Sergio Ojeda (Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico), Mary Elva Smith, Landon Whitsitt, and corresponding members Chris Murphy (Fuller Theological Seminary) and Alvin Padilla (Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary)

4. Chair **Kathy Wolf Reed** called to order the Executive Committee at 1:15 P.M. on Monday, September 16, 2013, in room C211 at Union Presbyterian **Executive Committee Met**

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

Seminary in Charlotte, declared a quorum, prayed, transacted business, and adjourned at 3:25 P.M.

5. Chair **Kathy Wolf Reed** welcomed the committee in the Library at 3:30 P.M. on Monday, September 16, 2013, called the meeting to order, confirmed **Lee Hinson-Hasty** as clerk, confirmed a quorum was present, and opened with prayer. Wolf Reed welcomed Nancy Ramsay as a new member liaison from the Presbyterian Mission Agency Board and guests, and asked for approval of the minutes of the March 2013 meeting and of the schedule and agenda for this meeting as approved and recommended by the Executive Committee. Wolf Reed reminded the committee of the continuing discussion around the committee's shifting identity as a data resource for theological education in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.). The **March 2013 Minutes** were approved, without objection or changes, as was **the proposed schedule**. She asked Coordinator Lee Hinson-Hasty to offer reflections on his written Coordinator's report as a way to set the tone for the meeting. Hinson-Hasty encouraged the committee to use its gifts as exegetes to listen carefully for the "splinter that calls us to explore more deeply" the research being done in theological education and to inductively investigate an emerging committee identity.

Opening
Plenary Actions:
Minutes and
Schedule
approved, and
Coordinator
Report received

6. Chair **Kathy Wolf Reed** invited **Sharon Miller** from the Center for the Study of Theological Education at Auburn Seminary to make a presentation on theological student enrollment, pathways to seminary, and seminarian debt. Miller presented portions of these soon-to-be released studies referencing the 2013 enrollment study distributed in the meeting packet. After the presentation and an opportunity for discussion, Wolf Reed adjourned the committee for dinner without objection at 5:45 P.M.

Plenary
Presentation:
Auburn Studies

7. Chair **Kathy Wolf Reed** welcomed faculty, staff, and board representatives from Union Presbyterian Seminary and asked President **Brian Blount** to introduce these guests and pray for the meal at 6:00 P.M. Dinner was served in the chapel and was followed by a presentation by **Sandy Irby**, director of the Communities of Learning Program, and a closing evening prayer service led by **Thomas W. Currie**, dean of the Charlotte Campus of Union Presbyterian Seminary and professor of theology.

Union
Presbyterian
Seminary
Presentation
and Evening
Prayers

Tuesday, September 17

8. **Kathy Wolf Reed** reconvened the committee with prayer at 9:00 in the library and recognized and thanked **David Esterline**, director, Institute for Cross-Cultural Theological Education, and associate professor of cross-cultural education & ministry at McCormick Seminary, for joining us to present a portion of the 2013 Survey on Global Theological Education study he helped conduct in cooperation with the World Council of Churches. After discussion, Wolf Reed recognized **Lee Hinson-Hasty** to report on his findings on the Committee on Theological Education project mapping international partnerships of Presbyterian World Mission and Presbyterian seminaries. Finally, the chair recognized General Assembly Moderator **Neal Presa** and Director of Theology, Worship, and Education for the

Learning Global
Plenary: Survey
on Global
Theological
Education,
Mapping
International
Partnerships,
and
Consultation on
Theological

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

Presbyterian Mission Agency **Chip Hardwick** to summarize their report and recommendations on a Consultation on Theological Education.

After hearing the three reports, Wolf Reed moderated a conversation on global theological education and invited the committee use the conversation as background for discussion in subcommittees and later in plenary. She recessed the committee for a break at 10:45 A.M.

**Education in
Asia**

9. **Kathy Wolf Reed** reconvened the committee at 11:00 A.M. in the library and called attention to an emerging central question over the last few committee meetings regarding the identity and vocation of the COTE. In March 2013, the COTE discussed becoming a PC(USA) theological education data resource, so she put three clarifying questions on the table for discussion. What are the unanswered questions the COTE needs to answer? What information does the COTE want to track? How can the COTE be a better data hub for PC(USA) theological education? To begin the discussion, Wolf Reed asked **Frank Yamada** and **Paul Roberts** to prepare and thereafter offer their reflections on these questions. After hearing them, Wolf Reed moderated a conversation on the COTE's identity and invited the committee to use the conversation as background for discussion in subcommittees and later in plenary.

**Learning
Plenary on Key
Questions on the
Identity of the
COTE**

10. **Wolf Reed** called on **Chandler Stokes** at 11:40 A.M. to close the morning session by leading the committee in giving thanks in prayer for former COTE member KC Ptomey, who died May 9, 2013. Referencing Psalm 1, Stokes quoted Ptomey's interpretation: "It is not that God gives us law as a way to become deserving, it's that God gives us a guide to the steps to respond to God's grace that God has been dishing up in generous measure since the first day of creation." Stokes then led the committee in giving thanks in prayer for lunch.

11. **Wolf Reed** called the committee back to order at 12:45 P.M. and recognized **Chandler Stokes** to introduce and moderate a discussion on meaningful support of seminaries that COTE might offer besides the theological education fund. After discussion, Wolf Reed invited the committee to use the conversation as background for discussion in subcommittees and later in plenary. She then dismissed the committee into standing subcommittees at 1:45 P.M..

**Generative
Plenary on
Supporting
Seminaries**

12. The committee was dismissed to meet as three standing subcommittees: **Theological and Church Concerns, Implementation and Interpretation,** and **Interschool and Mission Cooperation** from 2:00 to 3:45 P.M. in separate classrooms.

**Standing
Subcommittee
Meetings**

13. **Chandler Stokes**, chair of the Institutional Support Subcommittee called to order the Institutional Support Committee at 4:00 P.M., declared a quorum, prayed, transacted business, and adjourned at 6:00 P.M.

**Institutional
Support Met**

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

14. At 6:00 P.M., the committee concluded business meetings, returned to the South Park Doubletree Hotel, and, at 6:30 P.M., gathered for a reception and dinner. New Presbyterian Mission Agency Board liaison **Nancy Ramsay** was welcomed, and Kathy Wolf Reed was recognized for her birthday.

**Dinner
welcoming
Nancy Ramsay**

15. Subcommittee minutes were received from subcommittee clerks and chairs, collated, and distributed to committee members by Hinson-Hasty in a digital format via electronic mail at 11:57 P.M. and in a printed form Thursday morning.

**Minutes and
recommendations distributed**

Wednesday, September 18

16. After breakfast at 9:00 A.M., Wolf Reed called the committee to order in the library at Union Presbyterian Seminary, confirmed a quorum was still present, opened with prayer, and recognized, subcommittee chairs to offer reports and recommendations.

Closing Plenary

17. On the Executive Committee’s recommendation, the committee **voted, without objection, to approve the following invitations to host the Committee on Theological Education for the previously scheduled stated meetings:**

**Executive
Committee:**

- a. Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico, San Juan, PR: Feb. 25–27, 2014
- b. Montreat Conference Center: Sept. 15–17, 2014; Executive Committee only
- c. Princeton Theological Seminary, Princeton, NY: Feb. 24–26, 2015
- d. McCormick Theological Seminary, Chicago, IL: Sept. 21–23, 2015

**2014-15 Meeting
hosts approved**

18. Wolf Reed recognized **Chandler Stokes**, chair of **the Institutional Support Committee**, for their report.

**Institutional
Support:**

- a. Stokes reported the committee had reviewed and recommended the approval of the 2014 TEF distribution of allocations percentages based on the Allocation Formula and data submitted by the schools. In addition, the committee asked that as a part of the COTE visioning process over the next six months, that the allocation formula be visited with special attention to racial/ethnic seminary education at Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary and Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico. Without objection, it was approved.

**2014 TEF
Allocation
Percentages
Approved with
caveat**

2014 TEF Percentages	
School	Percentage
Austin	7.7144%
Columbia	10.8306%
Dubuque	7.6147%
E.S.P.R.	3.0351%
Louisville	8.0522%
McCormick	8.3469%
Pittsburgh	9.6237%
Princeton	18.4501%

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

S.F.T.S.	8.5448%
J.C. Smith	5.4241%
Union	9.8633%
Discretionary	2.5000%
Total	100.0000%

- b. Stokes reported the committee had reviewed and recommended the approval of the 2014 Theological Education Funds development budget as submitted with up to \$317,113 of the TEF contributed in 2013, but no more than 25.1 percent of the actual TEF gifts contributed, to be used for funds development and promotion of the TEF in 2014.
- c. Stokes reported the committee recommended approval and the COTE voted to approve that COTE provide generative conversation and strategic development about the financial viability of our racial/ethnic seminaries JCSTS and SEPR. This might take the form of establishing a task group.
- d. Stokes reported the committee recommended approval, and the COTE voted to approve, that COTE commend the report “Theological School Enrollment” study by Auburn’s Center for the Study of Theological Education and distribute it to presbyteries with a one-page summary of key findings.
- e. Stokes reported the committee recommended approval, and the COTE voted to approve, that the executive committee docket time in February to continue discussion of David Esterline’s report on the Global Survey of Theological Education, and consider asking him to attend the February meeting.
- f. Stokes reported the committee recommended approval, and the COTE voted to approve, that COTE express thanks and appreciation to Sharon Miller and David Esterline for excellent presentations.
- g. Stokes reported as information a wide-ranging discussion on the following topics:
 - i. A notation that African American women comprise the fastest growing group in seminary enrollment
 - ii. Concerns about students not understanding the crushing effect of massive debt as well as how best to communicate this concern with seminarians and committees on ministry and preparation for ministry and partner with the Board of Pensions fiscal fitness workshops
 - iii. A question about openness in the church, schools, and the COTE to broadening the understandings of ordination for seekers and/or entrepreneurial leaders
 - iv. A question about the impact on placement issues as a result of the timing of ministry transitions and the possibility of delayed retirements
 - v. An appreciation for the stability and strength of PC(USA) seminaries

2014 TEF Funds
Development
Budget

Strategic
Development of
JCSTS and
SEPR

Seminary
Enrollment
Study

Global
Theological
Education

Thanks to
Esterline and
Miller

Information
Items from
discussion

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

- 19. Wolf Reed called upon Max Sherman, chair of the Theological and Church Concerns (TCC) committee:**
- Theological and Church Concerns:**
- a. Sherman recommended approval as an omnibus motion on behalf of the committee and the COTE voted to approve:
 - i. Affirming the following two persons, in no particular order, receive the Award for Excellence in Theological Education in the 2013–2014 biennium and be recognized at the 221st General Assembly (2014): **Cynthia M. Campbell** and **Jack B. Rogers**.

Award for Excellence in Theological Education
 - ii. Receiving the report titled Consultation on Theological Education in Asia, presented by **Neal Presa** and **Chip Hardwick**, and affirm World Mission and Theology, Worship, and Education ministry areas of the Presbyterian Mission Agency and Board in their work with the COTE and PC(USA) seminaries to explore implementing its findings with the following caveat: the COTE nominating committee recommend a representative, an institutional representative if possible, from the COTE to join the Asia consultation and any other global consultations in the future.

Consultation on Theological Education in Asia
 - b. Affirming the direction of the Special Committee on Preparation for Ministry of the 220th General Assembly (2014) as described by committee staff **Timothy Cargal** and committee member **Nicholas Yoda**. Sherman asked for and Cargal and Yoda gave brief overviews of those directions orally to the COTE.

Special Committee on Preparation for Ministry
 - c. **Sherman** reported as information reports received by the committee on the following:
 - i. A report and phone conversation with Tom Hay from the Department of the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly on the possibility of a General Assembly standing rule change on the number of theological student advisory delegates (TSAD) being considered by the Biennial Review Committee of the 220th General Assembly (2012). A concern was voiced about how reducing the number of TSADs would also reduce the voice and presence of seminaries and future leaders of the church.

Theological Student Advisory Delegates
 - ii. Ongoing discussions with the Lilly Endowment about a planning grant

Lilly Grant
 - iii. Moderator Colloquia and Conversations as well as the Global Initiative on Funding Theological Institutions from Moderator Neal Presa

General Assembly Moderator Reports
- 20. Wolf-Reed recognized Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, chair of the Interschool and Mission Cooperation (IMC) committee, for its report.**
- Interschool and Mission Cooperation: Mapping Global Partners**
- a. **Cintrón-Olivieri** recommended on behalf of the committee, and COTE voted to approve, each of the following items:
 - i. Postponing any action and revisiting the report on mapping

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

- partnerships in PC(USA) seminaries and PC(USA) World Mission in spring 2015
- ii. Concurring with the Executive Committee recommendation to accept the invitation from the Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico to host the February 2014 stated meeting of the COTE
 - iii. Inviting Laura Cheifetz, executive director of church and public relations of the Presbyterian Publishing Corporation (PPC), to the February 2014 meeting for at least an hour-long conversation surrounding potential future PPC resources
- b. **Cintrón-Olivieri** reported as information reports received by the committee with gratitude from the following:
- i. Doctor of ministry (DMin) directors and academic deans cohorts' progress on their COTE cooperative grants with the expectation to hear more by fall 2014
 - ii. The Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico on its covenant with the General Assembly
 - iii. A common PC(USA) seminary application from Steve Hayner that was considered but lacked interest among the schools
 - iv. Racial Ethnic Seminarian Conference that will continue to be a separate event, restarting in 2014 and managed by the Racial Ethnic and Women's ministry area of the Presbyterian Mission Agency rather than the Office of Theological Education after consideration in 2013
21. Wolf Reed recognized **Mindy Douglas**, chair of the **Implementation and Interpretation (I&I) Committee**, for its report. Douglas reported as information reports received by the committee with gratitude from the following:
- a. **Jeffrey Bullock**, via Skype, on the General Assembly's Special Committee on Funding Theological Institutions. Bullock is now chair of this special committee
 - b. The coordinator's and associate's reports, including those on year-end thank you efforts of the TEF Seminary Support Network and the Seminary Support Network meeting at the PC(USA) Big Tent event in August 2013
 - c. **Olanda Carr**, Presbyterian Foundation ministry relations officer, and Rose Niles on the Theological Schools Endowment Fund as a Ministry Partnership Fund with the possibility for online giving
 - d. Presbyterian Mission Agency (PMA) Research Services reports on TEF donor congregations, the PMA program evaluation of the TEF, and the forthcoming Presbyterian Panel on Theological Education
22. With no other business, Wolf Reed invited those gathered to evaluate the meeting. She also encouraged everyone to complete an online evaluation that will be sent via electronic mail after the meeting.

Seminario Evangelico de Puerto Rico

Presbyterian Publishing Corporation

DMin and Dean Cohorts

Seminary Application

Racial Ethnic Seminarian Conference

Implementation and Interpretation

"Call Crisis" Data Working Group Proposed

Presbyterian Foundation Research Projects

Meeting Evaluation

PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD
April 23-25, 2014
Theology, Worship, and Education Ministry Area

23. At 10:20 A.M., without objection, Wolf Reed thanked everyone for their participation and declared the meeting adjourned after a closing worship service in the chapel led by **Richard Boyce**, dean-elect of the Charlotte Campus of Union Presbyterian Seminary and associate professor of preaching and pastor leadership.

Closing prayer
and
adjournment

Respectfully submitted on November 15, 2013,

Kathryn Wolf Reed, chair, Committee on Theological Education

Lee Hinson-Hasty, coordinator for Theological Education and Seminary Relations
