

**ITEM C.210  
FOR INFORMATION**

**COMMITTEE ON THEOLOGICAL EDUCATION (COTE)  
Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)  
Minutes  
San Juan, Puerto Rico; February 25–26, 2014**

1. The meeting of the Committee on Theological Education (COTE) was held February 25–26, 2014, in San Juan, Puerto Rico, and was hosted for the first time by Seminario Evangélico de Puerto Rico.

2. **The following persons attended, constituting a quorum:**

**Members:** Alan Bancroft, Jeffrey Bullock (University of Dubuque Theological Seminary), William Carl (Pittsburgh Theological Seminary), Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, Mindy Douglas, Susan Garrett (Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary), José Irizarry, Kenneth Kovacs (Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary), Matthew Miles, Deborah Mullen (Columbia Theological Seminary), Nancy Ramsay (Presbyterian Mission Agency Board liaison), Mary Elva Smith, Chandler Stokes, Landon Whitsitt, and K. Nicholas Yoda.

**Covenant Member:** Sergio Ojeda Cárcamo (Seminario Evangélico de Puerto Rico)

**Corresponding Member:** Chris Murphy (Fuller Theological Seminary)

**Staff from the Office of Theological Education:** Lee Hinson-Hasty (coordinator) and Nancy Benson-Nicol (associate)

**Adjunct Staff:** Timothy Cargal (Office of the General Assembly), Charles B. Hardwick (director of Theology, Worship, and Education, Presbyterian Mission Agency), and Catherine Reuning (Theology, Worship, and Education)

**Seminario Evangélico Guests:** Javier Goitia, (academic dean), Luis Ocasio (pastor, San Juan's Presbyterian Church), Myrna Perez, Wilma Quiñoues (pastor, Country Club Presbyterian Church of Carolina, PR), and Eileen Rivera (seminarian)

**Other Guests:** Laura M. Cheifetz (Presbyterian Publishing Corporation), Deborah Coe (Research Services, Presbyterian Mission Agency), and on Wednesday, Rose Eileen Niles (Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary).

3. **Excused Absences:** Craig Barnes (Princeton Theological Seminary), Brian Blount (Union Presbyterian Seminary), Gary Eller (Omaha Presbyterian Seminary Foundation), Stephen Hayner (Columbia Theological Seminary), Katherine Henderson (Auburn Theological Seminary), Michael Jinkins (Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary), James McDonald (San Francisco Theological Seminary), Alvin Padilla (Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary), Kathy Wolf Reed (chair), Paul Roberts (Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary), Max Sherman, Glen Snider (Presbyterian Mission Agency Board liaison), Theodore Wardlaw (Austin Presbyterian Theological Seminary), and Frank Yamada (McCormick Theological Seminary)

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**

**April 23-25, 2014**

**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

4. Vice Chair **Jeffrey Bullock** called to order the Executive Committee at 7:15 a.m. on Tuesday, February 25, 2014, in the Gardita Room at the Sheraton Old San Juan Hotel, Puerto Rico, and declared a quorum with Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, Mindy Douglas, Chandler Stokes, K. Nicholas Yoda for Max Sherman, and Kathy Wolf Reed via video teleconference. Bullock prayed, moderated the meeting, and adjourned at 8:00 a.m. to join other committee members and guests as all were shuttled to the campus of Seminario Evangélico.
5. **Jeffrey Bullock** welcomed the committee in room 2-AB at the Seminario Evangélico at 9:15 a.m. on Tuesday, February 25, 2014; called the meeting to order; confirmed **Lee Hinson-Hasty** as clerk; confirmed a quorum was present as Susan Garrett, Kenneth Kovacs, and Deborah Mullen were voted on by their respective seminary boards to have voting power; and opened with prayer. He then thanked Sergio Ojeda Cárcamo for hosting this historically first meeting of COTE at SEPR, and Ojeda Cárcamo offered a welcoming statement introducing the seminary and welcoming the committee. Bullock welcomed Garrett and Mullen as substituted members, Chris Murphy as a new corresponding member, and guests. As a way of reintroducing one another, the vice chair asked each person to describe his or her current context for ministry. On behalf of the Executive Committee, Bullock asked for approval of the minutes of the September 2013 meeting and of the schedule and agenda for this meeting as approved and recommended by the Executive Committee. The **September 2013 minutes** were approved, without objection or changes, as was **the proposed schedule** as distributed. He asked Hinson-Hasty to offer reflections on his written coordinator's report as a way to set the tone for the meeting. Hinson-Hasty encouraged the committee to "midwife" what is next in theological education, starting with the actions before us to be considered by the 221st General Assembly and based on the research distributed and to be presented.
6. **Jeffrey Bullock** introduced the opportunity COTE had to officially submit comments on any or all business before the General Assembly as a committee that reports directly to the General Assembly. Bullock then introduced the report of the Special Committee on Funding Theological Institutions and invited other members of the special committee present to comment. After a time of questions, Bullock called on staff resource persons to introduce and summarize other business reports before the General Assembly in the meeting packet. Members then were invited to add any other items for which they wanted COTE to consider placing a comment. After an opportunity for discussion, Bullock adjourned the committee for a break without objection at 10:30 a.m.
7. **Jeffrey Bullock** welcomed **Deborah Coe**, coordinator for Research Services for the Presbyterian Mission Agency, and invited her to present the May 2013 Presbyterian Panel survey on theological education. After the presentation and an opportunity for questions and

**Executive  
Committee Met**

**Opening Plenary  
Actions: Minutes  
and Schedule  
Approved and  
Coordinator  
Report Received**

**Plenary  
Discussion of  
Business Before  
the 221st General  
Assembly (2014)**

**Presentation:  
Presbyterian  
Panel on  
Theological**

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**  
**April 23-25, 2014**  
**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

answers, Bullock thanked Coe and adjourned the committee and guests for lunch in the seminary cafeteria at noon.

**Education**

8. **Jeffrey Bullock** reconvened the committee at 1:05 p.m. in room 2-AB and recognized and thanked **David Esterline**, director of the Institute for Cross-Cultural Theological Education and associate professor of cross-cultural education and ministry at McCormick Theological Seminary, for joining us via video teleconference to present the 2013 Survey on Global Theological Education study he helped conduct in cooperation with the World Council of Churches, as well as the Association of Theological Schools resolution on global awareness and engagement. After the presentation and an opportunity for questions and answers, Bullock adjourned the committee for a break without objection at 2:00 p.m.

**Global Plenary:  
Survey on Global  
Theological  
Education**

9. **Jeffrey Bullock** reconvened the committee at 2:15 p.m. in room 2-AB and recognized and thanked **Chandler Stokes** for leading the committee in a plenary discussion and time of learning on the financial and strategic viability and support of our racial ethnic seminaries, Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary and the Seminario Evangélico de Puerto Rico. After the opportunity for discussion, Bullock adjourned the committee at 3:15 p.m. so that the Institutional Support subcommittee could meet and have dinner afterward.

**Support of Racial  
Ethnic Seminaries**

10. **Chandler Stokes**, chair of the Institutional Support subcommittee, called to order the Institutional Support committee at 3:32 p.m., declared a quorum, prayed, transacted business, and adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

**Institutional  
Support Met**

11. The committee members were shuttled back to the Sheraton Old San Juan for a 7:00 p.m. dinner.

**Wednesday, February 26**

12. The committee arrived at the Seminario Evangélico at 9:00 a.m. Wednesday, February 26, 2014, and joined the community for worship in the James McAllister Chapel. Sergio Ojeda Cárcamo led the worship service with the assistance of Jeffrey Bullock, Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri, Lee Hinson-Hasty, and Kenneth Kovacs, with Bill Carl playing the piano and Dean Francisco J. Goitía Padilla preaching on Matthew 5.

**Worship at  
Seminary**

13. The committee was dismissed to meet as three standing subcommittees: **Theological and Church Concerns, Implementation and Interpretation, and Interschool and Mission Cooperation** from 10:00 to 11:45 a.m. in separate classrooms, with the first two meeting jointly and everyone together for lunch in the cafeteria afterward.

**Standing Sub-  
committee  
Meetings and  
Lunch**



**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**  
**April 23-25, 2014**  
**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

congregations and individual donors to the Theological Education Fund, both in their management and generation; and

- c. WHEREAS, this recommendation represents the combined effort of four PC(USA) entities (Presbyterian Mission Agency, Committee on Theological Education, the Presbyterian Foundation, and the Special Committee on Funding Theological Institutions);
- d. THEREFORE, the Committee on Theological Education unanimously recommends **the approval of the report and recommendations** of the Special Committee on Funding Theological Institutions to the 221st General Assembly (2014).

COTE voted unanimously to approve.

The committee then thanked and recognized Laura Cheifetz and Jeffrey Bullock, who each chaired the Special Committee on Funding Theological Institutions, as well as the members of the special committee present.

19. Jeffrey Bullock called on **Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri**, chair of the Interschool and Mission Cooperation committee, and **K. Nicholas Yoda**, acting chair of the Theological and Church Concerns (TCC) committee. Cintrón-Olivieri reported the committees jointly recommend that:

**Theological and Church Concerns and Interschool and Mission Cooperation:**

- a. COTE ask the academic deans to invite Presbyterian Mission Agency staff to meet with them to discuss seminary efforts and collaboration for preparing students for leadership of new worshiping communities and bring any recommendations and reports to the Executive Committee of COTE by August 15, 2014. COTE voted and approved unanimously.
- b. COTE direct the coordinator for theological education to distribute the research questionnaire, summary of findings, data tables, presentation, and other background materials to all COTE members and related schools, including the academic deans, and encourage that any questions be directed to Deborah Coe, PC(USA) Research Services of the PMA. Furthermore, it was recommended that the minutes reflect that COTE express appreciation to Deborah Coe and her colleagues for this research, presentation, and engagement with COTE. COTE voted and approved unanimously.
- c. COTE direct the coordinator to send and commend the Global Survey on Theological Education to COTE-related institutions for study and response by January 15, 2015, with our thanks to David Esterline and his colleagues for the research and presentation. COTE voted and approved

**New Worshiping Communities**

**Presbyterian Panel to be Distributed**

**Global Survey on Theological Education**

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**  
**April 23-25, 2014**  
**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

unanimously.

- |            |   |   |
|------------|---|---|
| d.         | COTE encourage the coordinator to continue working on the project on seminarian financial wellness as described in the draft proposal distributed and to report back by January 15, 2015. COTE voted and approved unanimously.  | <b>Seminarian<br/>Financial<br/>Wellness Project</b>                                |
| e.         | COTE comment on the Committee on Biennial Review of the General Assembly's "III. Recommendation 3: d) Concerning section B.2.e. [of the Assembly Manual of Operations] on Theological Student Advisory Delegates," encouraging commissioners not to approve the recommendation, with a rationale drafted by K. Nicholas Yoda and Matthew Miles and approved by the Executive Committee on behalf of COTE. COTE voted and approved unanimously.  | <b>Comment on<br/>Biennial Review<br/>Recommend-ation<br/>on TSADs</b>              |
| f.         | COTE officially comment on recommendations 8 and 10, commending the work of the Special Committee on Preparation for Ministry that is before the 221st General Assembly (2014), and provide a rationale drafted by Alan Bancroft and K. Nicholas Yoda and approved by the Executive Committee on behalf of COTE. COTE voted and approved unanimously.   | <b>Comment on the<br/>Special<br/>Committee on<br/>Preparation for<br/>Ministry</b> |
| <b>20.</b> | Matthew Miles moved and Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri seconded that COTE direct the Executive Committee of the COTE to docket the request received February 18, 2014, from Fuller Theological Seminary for discussion. COTE voted and approved unanimously.   | <b>Request from<br/>Fuller Seminary</b>   |
| <b>21.</b> | Jeffrey Bullock recognized <b>Chandler Stokes</b> , chair of the <b>Institutional Support committee</b> , for the committee's report. Stokes moved on behalf of the committee:  | <b>Institutional<br/>Support</b>  |
| a.         | COTE distribution of the TEF allocation for 2014 be continued as previously approved, with the discretionary fund (estimated to be \$27,000) distributed to Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary and the Seminario Evangélico de Puerto Rico. Jeffrey Bullock recognized <b>Landon Whitsitt</b> who moved that the motion be amended to add, "and that the TEF discretionary fund for 2014 be distributed as follows: 75% to Johnson C. Smith Theological Seminary, 25% to Seminario Evangélico de Puerto Rico." Chandler Stokes seconded the amendment and COTE voted to approve the amendment. COTE then voted to approve the motion unanimously. Jeffrey Bullock and others thanked <b>Kenneth Kovacs</b> , representing JCSTS, for the candor of his report on February 25, 2014, and expressed gratefulness for the mission and direction of the board and president, Paul Roberts. Stokes encouraged everyone present to make a personal contribution to the TEF and instructed the coordinator to add that donated amount to the discretionary fund distribution to JCSTS and SEPR. | <b>Discretionary<br/>Fund Allocation in<br/>2014</b>                                |
|            |   | <b>All Invited to<br/>Donate to<br/>Discretionary<br/>Fund</b>                      |

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**  
**April 23-25, 2014**  
**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

- b.
- c. For the 2015 distribution of Theological Education Funds, COTE formed a task force to develop a formula that revises the distribution of the TEF based on criteria that address inequities of historic and contemporary racism in our church and culture to present to COTE by September 2014. Furthermore, for the task force to be appointed by the nominating committee by March 15, 2014, to include three (3) institutional members, four (4) elected members, and two (2) members of the Seminary Support Network. **Nancy Ramsay** moved and **José Irizarry** seconded the motion be amended to read, “The COTE nominating committee appoint by March 15, 2014, a task force to include three (3) institutional members, four (4) elected members, and two (2) members of the Seminary Support Network to revise the distribution formula of the TEF based on criteria that addresses inequities of historic and contemporary racism in our church and culture and to report regularly to the COTE and, furthermore, to bring a recommendation to the COTE no later than February of 2016.” COTE voted and approved unanimously.
- d. That COTE invite a COTE conversation with partner seminaries to learn how they currently are helping students shaped by the dominant culture to understand privilege, reflect on and deconstruct its effects in their own lives, and develop strategic and theological skills for engaging in the work of resisting such privilege.

**Task Force to  
Revisit the TEF  
Allocation  
Formula**

**Future  
Conversation on  
How Seminaries  
Address Privilege  
Invited**

Stokes emphasized the possibility of wedding the promotional efforts of the TEF with Theological Education Sunday.

22. **Jeffrey Bullock** asked **Chandler Stokes** to chair and for **Landon Whitsitt** to report for the nominating committee. Whitsitt moved on behalf of the nominating committee as an omnibus motion:

**Officers for  
COTE in 2014–  
2016 Biennium  
Elected**

- a. The following leadership roles for COTE for the 2014–2016 biennium:
  - 1) Chair of COTE: Jeffrey Bullock
  - 2) Vice chair of COTE: Mindy Douglas
  - 3) Chair of Theological and Church Concerns: Max Sherman
  - 4) Chair of Interschool and Mission Cooperation: Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri
  - 5) Chair of Implementation and Interpretation: Paul Roberts
  - 6) Chair of Institutional Support: Mary Elva Smith
  - 7) Executive Committee Members at Large: Frank

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**  
**April 23-25, 2014**  
**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

Yamada and José Irizzary

- b. That COTE and ultimately the General Assembly Nominating Committee renew the COTE Class of 2014—Alan Bancroft, Matthew Miles, and Mary Elva Smith—for a second term through 2020.
- c. That COTE submit the advice and counsel of the nominating committee to the General Assembly Nominating Committee as distributed.
- d. That James McDonald be confirmed as the COTE representative on the Presbyterian Mission Agency Consultation on Theological Education in Asia.

**GANC Advice and  
Counsel**

**Asia Consultation  
Represent-ative**

The committee discussed and voted to approve.

- 23. Jeffrey Bullock recognized Nancy Ramsay to ask a question about recommendation 10 of the Special Committee on Preparation for Ministry.
- 24. After a break from 4:15 p.m. to 4:30 p.m., Jeffrey Bullock reconvened the committee for a conversation led by **Laura Cheifetz** on partnership possibilities with the Presbyterian Publishing Corporation. Cheifetz used the World Café approach to generate multiple product and resource ideas that COTE affirmed. She will bring these ideas to the PPC editorial group for further development and will report back to COTE as appropriate.
- 25. At 5:25 p.m., Jeffrey Bullock called on **Vilmarie Cintrón-Olivieri** to lead a brief recognition of the last meeting for the following members: **Glen Snider, Sergio Ojeda Cárcamo, Landon Whitsitt, and K. Nicholas Yoda** and former Associate for Theological Education, **Rose Eileen Niles**. Cintrón-Olivieri showed a video collage that thanked each and encouraged departing colleagues “To call us anytime” because we “will miss you so bad.”
- 26. With no other business, **Jeffrey Bullock** invited those gathered to evaluate the meeting. He also encouraged everyone to complete an online evaluation that will be sent via electronic mail after the meeting.
- 27. At 5:30 p.m., without objection, **Jeffrey Bullock** thanked everyone for their participation and declared the meeting adjourned after prayer and a closing dinner. The committee returned to the Sheraton Old San Juan and, at 6:30 p.m., gathered for dinner at Barrachina in Old San Juan and continued to show appreciation for rotating members.

**Clarification on  
Report of the  
Special  
Committee on  
Preparation for  
Ministry**

**Partnerships with  
Presbyterian  
Publishing  
Corporation**

**Recognition of  
Rotating  
Members and  
Former Associate**

**Meeting  
Evaluation**

**Closing Prayer  
and Adjournment**

**PRESBYTERIAN MISSION AGENCY BOARD**  
**April 23-25, 2014**  
**Theology, Worship and Education Ministry Area**

Respectfully submitted on March 11, 2014,

---

Jeffrey F. Bullock, vice chair, Committee on Theological Education

---

Lee Hinson-Hasty, coordinator for Theological Education and  
Seminary Relations

---